A Local Legislative Model for the Reduction and Elimination of Environmental Pollution in Thailand

Nuntapol Karnjanawat¹ and Sunee Mallikamarl²

Abstract

In Thailand, it is the duty of local administrative organizations to protect people’s environmental rights within their locality. However, few local ordinances have been passed to prescribe authority to address environmental protection. This study investigated the existing laws that affect the development of local ordinances for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution and the problems affecting their development. The methods used by the study were documentary review, legal analysis and gathering of information from key stakeholders through group discussions at two seminars.

The results of the study were used to develop a local legislative model guided by the concept derived from the U.S. Uniform Law or Model Act. The structure of the model contains the principle and rationale of the legislation; its title, preambles, and definitions; the person in charge; procedures for cancellation, amendments and additions; changes of wording; chapter organization and structure; enforceability; interim provisions; and attached schedules.

To efficiently carry out the drafting of local ordinances, the authors suggest that an organization be established to support law enforcement in addressing environmental issues. Such an organization could gather knowledge and information relevant to these measures from various law enforcing agencies under the central administration that is engaging in tasks concerning the enhancement and conservation of national environmental quality.

Keywords: local legislative model, environmental pollution, decentralization, environmental rights

¹ Nuntapol Karnjanawat is a Ph.D. candidate and recipient of the RGJ-Ph.D. Scholarship. He is currently working at Chayapa and Partners Co., Ltd. in Bangkok. E-mail address: Nuntapol_K@yahoo.com
² Sunee Mallikamarl is a law professor at the National Institute of Development Administration (NIDA), Bangkok. E-mail address: ProfSunee@gmail.com

This study was supported by the grant made possible by the Royal Golden Jubilee Ph.D. Program, Thailand Research Fund. The authors gratefully acknowledge this kind support without which the present article would not have been possible.
**Introduction**

Though Thailand has been classified as a middle-income country, there are gaps in the ability of current government policies to protect the quality of life while still ensuring economic stability. As a consequence, the country continues to face environmental problems caused by the destruction of natural resources and pollution that are due principally to industrial activities. In response to global environmental problems, the United Nations organized an international conference on environment and development in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil in 1992 which was the largest UN Conference ever held (Sand, 1992). The Conference reached consensus on major principles regarding sustainable development which signified the importance of environmental management in parallel to development. In 1987, the World Commission on Environment and Development (WCED) published a report entitled *Our Common Future* (known as the Brundtland Report) which confirmed how environmental problems taking place worldwide cause substantial health problems and loss of life. The report defined Sustainable Development as “development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generation to meet their own needs” (Commission on Environment and Development (WCED), 1987). Sustainable development is considered an essential principle for United Nations member countries, including Thailand, to put into practice.

Thailand has confirmed the importance of the sustainable development principle by incorporating it in all National Economic and Social Development Plans since National Economic and Social Development Plan No. 8, B.E. 2540-2544 (A.D. 1997-2001). In addition, the environmental rights principle is included in the Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand in Article 67, paragraph one, which provides that,

(t)he right of a person to participate with State and communities in the preservation and exploitation of natural resources and biological diversity and in the protection, promotion and conservation of the quality of the environment for usual and consistent survival in the environment which is not hazardous to his health and sanitary condition, welfare or quality of life, shall be protected appropriately.

In order to physically protect environmental rights, Article 85 of the Constitution provides directive principles of fundamental state policies concerning land, natural resources, and environment in five respects, as follows:

1. prescribing rules on the use of land throughout the country with due regard to compliance with environmental conditions; the nature of land and water and the way of life of local communities, efficient measures for the preservation of natural resources, and standards for sustainable land use that allow participation in decision making by the people of the area affected by the land use rules;
(2) distributing rights to hold land fairly, enabling farmers to be entitled to ownership or rights in land for agriculture by means of land reform or by other means, and providing water resources for the distribution of water to farmers for use in agriculture adequately and appropriately;

(3) contriving town and country plans, and effectively and efficiently developing and carrying out the same for the purpose of sustainable preservation of natural resources;

(4) contriving systematic management plans for water and other resources beneficial to the public, and encouraging the people to participate in the preservation, maintenance, and exploitation of natural resources and biological diversity with equilibrium; and

(5) enhancing, maintaining, and protecting environmental quality in accordance with the principle of sustainable development, and controlling and eliminating pollution affecting health, hygiene, welfare and quality of life of the public by requiring the people, local communities, and the local administrations to participate in determining the direction of the undertakings.

All five directive principles of fundamental state policies are considered to be binding upon all governmental organizations concerned. These include administrative organizations at the central, regional and local levels. The endeavor to protect rights in support of the directive principles of fundamental state policies can only go forward when these are enacted as law. Legislation is a major tool for governmental organizations to implement policies in the public interest. Current directives on environmental quality enhancement and the conservation role of local administrations are found in Article 290 of the Constitution, which requires local administrations to participate in the enhancement and conservation of environmental quality in conjunction with other governmental organizations. Such role is defined in four major respects: the management, maintenance, and exploitation of natural resources and environment in the area of the locality; participation in the maintenance of natural resources and environment outside the area of the locality only in the event that the quality of the environment or the health and hygiene of the people within the locality may be affected; participation in scrutinizing any project initiation or activity outside the area of the locality which may affect the quality of the environment or the health and hygiene of the people within the locality; and participation of the local community.

The importance of the exercise of the authority of the local administration under Article 290 is similar to what mentioned above, i.e., an organic law must be passed to support the enforcement. However, under the principle of democratic government, although local administration is carried out by local administrative organizations in accordance with the law, they are overseen by the central and regional administration. In addition, the central administration is also empowered to exercise their authority concerning enhancement and conservation of environmental quality even while the enforcement of which has been distributed to local administrations. This means that local administrations are bound to operate under a systematic framework of law.
Local administrations of all types are required to understand the legal frameworks of their authority. Under the supervision of central and regional administration and in accordance with the principle of decentralization of power, local administrations must be able to efficiently and jointly participate in the reduction and elimination of pollution activities as part of enhancement and conservation of environmental quality within their jurisdiction. They are required to strictly follow the provisions of law, and are not at liberty to take action outside of this framework even in situations where it is publicly beneficial to the people within their jurisdiction. Thus exercising local authority to reduce and eliminate pollution or other environmental problems must take place without power struggles or interference with the operations of the central or regional administrative organizations under the same government administration system.

It is, therefore, necessary for local administrations to have as their major tool local legislation or ordinances to efficiently carry out their authority. Without these laws, such endeavors are illegal and thus may incur civil, criminal, or administrative liability to the implementing organizations and officials involved. Administration that is not supported by law is repugnant to the rule of law.

The Act Prescribing Plan and Procedure for the Decentralization of Power to Local Administrative organizations, B.E. 2542 (A.D. 1999) included decentralizing the power and responsibility to reduce and eliminate environmental pollution to local administrations. Based on the above discussion, all types of local administrations established by law are required to carry out these activities and to have available local ordinances to support their undertakings. These include the sub-district or Tambol Administrative Organization (TAO), the provincial or Changwat Administrative Organization (CAO), municipalities, and Bangkok Metropolis. Yet at present, few local administrations, if any, have developed such by-laws to support the enforcement of the law. This is due largely to the limited experience in preparation of local ordinances and lack of clarity in the scope of their authority. For this reason, environmental pollution problems have expanded and now severely affected ecological systems and health of people in many parts of the country. Examples that the news media have highlighted include environmental problems caused by industrial activities in Map Ta Phut Industrial Estate, Rayong province, and those caused by coal transportation at Tambon Ta Sai, Samut Sakorn province. It should be noted that each of the local administrative organizations in these jurisdictions did not take part in the management of environmental pollution at all.

In 2004, the Office of the Committee for the Decentralization of Power to local administrative organizations confirmed that the role of local administrative organizations in the enhancement and conservation of environmental quality has been very minimal, both in terms of the preparation of local ordinances and the enforcement of various environmental laws and regulations under their authority. Besides this, more than one environmental law may prescribe authority for the same matter to various governmental organizations, causing authorities to overlap one another. This confuses local administrative organizations as to their scope of
authority. Moreover, the provisions authorizing local administrative organizations give little
detail and thus the clarity of the operation as provided by law is lacking. In addition, it is
difficult to proclaim authority through a local ordinance as it is a subordinate law which has to
follow the criteria and conditions provided in the Act. With regard to the procedure for the
formulation of local ordinances, the drafters are required to be knowledgeable in law-making.
Moreover, environmental management is interconnected with other sciences, including
economic, technological, social, and legal measures (Mallikamarl, 1999). As it is required that
the drafters of local ordinances should be knowledgeable of these concepts, theories and
interconnected measures concerning the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution,
the formulation of local ordinances on these issues is more difficult than that of contract laws
or torts (Bates, 1995).

This host of problems, obstacles and limitations in formulating local ordinances on the
reduction and elimination of environmental pollution has minimized the role of local
administrative organizations. The burden of law enforcement on almost all environmental
problems taking place in the localities has thus shifted to central and regional administrations
or NGOs for resolution or assertion of claims for compensation on behalf of the people
affected by pollution. This reflects the failure of decentralization as an effective mechanism to
reduce or eliminate environmental problems at the local level, and people have not been as well
or as thoroughly protected by the state as they could have been.

In view of the above discussion, the ultimate aim of the research described in this article is to
promote and support local administrative organizations to produce effective local ordinances
for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution. This is to be accomplished by
designing a local ordinance model to be used as guidance for the organizations.

Research Methodology

Qualitative research methods were used to design the local ordinance model, using the two
methodologies described below.

Documentary Research

Law documents and documents related to the preparation of model law for the reduction and
elimination of environmental pollution, both from Thailand and other countries, were reviewed
to find material relevant to the following three points: (1) the scope of powers and duties of
local administrative organizations; (2) the structure and type of a local legislative model; and
(3) techniques and content preparation to be prescribed in local legislation for the reduction
and elimination of environmental pollution. In this regard, the documents reviewed were
divided into two groups, as follows:
Group 1: Law and regulatory documents related to the decentralization of administrative power, people’s participation, sustainable development, and the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution. This group was comprised of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand, B.E. 2550 (A.D. 2007); acts concerning the establishment of five types of local administrative organizations (i.e., the Municipality Act, B.E. 2496 (A.D. 1953), the Act for the Administration of Bangkok Metropolis, B.E. 2528 (A.D. 1985), the Tambon Council and Tambon Administrative Organization Act, B.E. 2537 (A.D. 1994), the Provincial Administrative Organization Act, B.E. 2540 (A.D. 1997), and the Act for the Administration of Pattaya City, B.E. 2542 (A.D. 1999)), and finally the Act Prescribing Plan and Procedure for the Decentralization of Power to Local Administrative Organizations, B.E. 2542 (A.D. 1999).

Group 2: Other documents relevant to the decentralization of administrative power, people’s participation, sustainable development, environmental management, reduction and elimination of environmental pollution, and international and national model laws, such as textbooks, research reports, articles, and publications of various types with references.

**Stakeholder Discussion Meetings**

Seminars were held to provide an opportunity for key stakeholders to freely express their opinion and exchange their experiences on these topics. The first seminar included discussions with two groups of key stakeholders. Group 1 consisted of administrators or their representatives from local administrative organizations in town or rural areas from four regions (North, Northeast, Central and South). At least 30 persons were included from each region. A brainstorming seminar was held with this group to obtain information concerning the nature and severity of the environmental problems existing in the jurisdiction of the local administrative organizations. This information included the nature of the problems and obstacles faced by the localities as well as relevant points of law in their current efforts to address environmental pollution.

Five points were assigned to Group 1 for discussion: (1) environmental situations in their areas of jurisdiction; (2) problems in the management, maintenance and exploitation of natural resources and environment in their localities; (3) problems concerning participation in the maintenance of natural resources and environment outside the area of jurisdiction where the livelihood of the people within the area of jurisdiction was affected; (4) problems concerning participation in the scrutiny of project initiation or other activities affecting the environmental quality or the people’s health and hygiene in the area of jurisdiction; and (5) problems in the enforcement of the law concerning protection of natural resources and environment of the local administrative organizations.
Group 2 consisted of representatives from 20 government agencies at the central level of administration, including those at the ministerial departmental level with powers and duties overseeing local administrative organizations or enforcing the Acts relevant to the reduction and elimination of pollution. Two discussion points were assigned to Group 2: (1) the current situation regarding decentralization of power to local administrative organizations for environmental matters; and (2) problems and obstacles in this area.

A second seminar was held to seek comments and opinions on a draft of a local legislative model for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution. The purpose of the seminar was to seek suggestions for improvement and potential revisions for future applications. Participants in the second seminar consisted of 20 competent officials of various Tambol, Muang and Nakorn Municipal Areas from provinces in the central region who were directly involved in the preparation of municipal ordinances under the Municipality Act, B.E. 2496 (A.D. 1953). Some participants were administrators charged with powers and duties to propose municipal ordinances or their representatives, while others were members of municipal councils with powers and duties to propose, scrutinize and proclaim municipal ordinances.

**Study Findings**

A descriptive analysis of the information collated by the study gives the following findings:

*Scope of powers and duties as provided by law of local administrative organizations for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution:* The powers and duties of local administrative organizations for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution in Thailand are prescribed in four clusters of laws, as follows:

*The Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand, B.E. 2550 (A.D. 1997)*

As outlined above, the Constitution, as the supreme law of the land, provides the roles, powers and duties to local administrative organizations for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution under Article 290. However, this does not mean that the local administrative organizations are automatically vested with such powers and duties. This is because Article 290 of the Constitution provides that “a local administrative organization has the powers and duties to promote and conserve the quality of the environment as provided by law.” This means that the Constitution provides the basis for related acts, which in turn could be used as the basis for local administrative organizations to proclaim their local ordinances in detail. From the time of promulgation of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand, B.E. 2540 (A.D. 1997), to the present Constitution, no such law has been passed so far and no local administrative organizations or NGOs have come forward to demand the passage of a law or amendments to the related laws.

This Act was passed because the Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand, B.E. 2540 (A.D. 1997) decentralized administrative powers to local administrative organizations. It clearly provides powers and duties in the performance of public services by different types of localities. The Act also establishes an organization at the national level to carry out the decentralization of power, namely the Committee for the Decentralization of Power to Local Administrative Organizations. It requires the preparation of Plans for Decentralization of Power and an Operation Plan Prescribing Procedures for Decentralization of Power to Local Administrative Organizations under various laws concerning the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution. In this regard, the Act has already provided the powers and duties of the local administrative organizations in accordance with such laws.

Five Acts Establishing Local Administrative Organizations

This cluster of laws provides criteria and methods for the establishment of each type of local administrative organization. It also provides the authority framework of the local administrative organizations in the same manner as does the Act Prescribing Plan and Procedure for the Decentralization of Power to Local Administrative Organizations, B.E. 2542 (A.D. 1999). In addition, the laws provide details in the preparation of local ordinances and also the relationship between local administrative organizations and central and regional governmental organizations having powers and duties to oversee the operation of the local administrative organizations. This cluster of laws also provides sources of powers and duties for each type of local administrative organizations in the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution.

Acts related to the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution

This cluster of laws contains Acts dealing with operations in the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution of the country. The document review revealed that there are 10 Acts that permit local administrative organizations to participate with central or regional governmental organizations in the operations or enforcement of laws to address environmental problems. This cluster can be divided into two groups. The first group contains seven Acts expressly providing local administrative organizations with the scope of their powers and duties.¹ The second group does not contain such acts, however they are provided for under the Decentralization Plan described earlier, and certain powers and duties have been assigned by subordinate legislations such as Announcements, Regulations, and Orders.²

In summary, the scope of authority for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution of local administrative organizations in Thailand can be examined from the abovementioned four clusters of laws which prescribe powers and duties for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution incorporating management of air, water, and soil
pollution, garbage and hazardous waste. In this regard, local administrative organizations are empowered to prepare local ordinances addressing these issues without being in conflict with the laws of higher strata, i.e., the Acts empowering them. This is considered an important principle for the preparation of local ordinances as provided in the Acts establishing all five types of local administrative organizations.

Problems and obstacles of the local administrative organizations in the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution: The information gathered from the first stakeholder seminar showed that the representatives of the local administrative organizations did not have clear knowledge on the scope of powers and duties provided in the various Acts. In practice, local administrative organizations did not perceive the importance of the preparation of local ordinances concerning reduction and elimination of environmental pollution. They considered the matter as being too complicated and had no examples to follow. However, this differs from the preparation of ordinances concerning budget expenditure and fee collection as income of the local administrative organizations, which they undertake annually. In addition, the majority of local administrative organization representatives admitted that their ordinance preparing personnel lack knowledge and expertise in the matter and do not know the elements required to be incorporated in the local ordinances to make them enforceable without being inconsistent with the laws of higher strata. They saw this failure as a result of lack of enthusiasm in making supports or transfers of knowledge, equipment, and sufficient budget from governmental organizations under central and regional administration to enable the development of such ordinances. This information confirms the existence of problems in the decentralization act which requires the preparation of local ordinances to address environmental issues without giving local administrative organizations the expertise and understanding needed to develop them.

Information gathered from the representatives of government agencies under the central administration that oversees the local administrative organizations came to similar conclusions. Lack of preparedness, incompetency of personnel, insensitivity and indifference of the local administrative organizations towards the preparation of local ordinances to address environmental issues were cited as obstacles.

A local legislative model for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution: The document review revealed that no suitable structure or format for local ordinances have been prescribed by any laws or regulations in Thailand. This is unlike the acts and regulations of the central and regional administrations, the structure and format of which have been clearly laid out by organizations specialized in law drafting, namely the Office of the Council of State under the Prime Minister's Office. Since only a few local ordinances exist, such as the Local Ordinance on Collection, Haulage, and Disposal of Waste or Refuse, they are insufficient to serve as examples for the local administrative organizations to follow, and thus the structure and format of local ordinances vary. Based on the information gathered from the first key stakeholder seminar, the variable structure and format of local ordinances is due to adaptation from existing ones or duplication from those of large local administrative organizations such as the Bangkok Metropolis.
Due to the abovementioned problematic situation, most local administrative organizations are hesitant to draw up their own local ordinances on the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution in new areas or where problems take place in several jurisdictions. Some local ordinances that have been developed have essential differences that make it difficult to address certain pollution problems, such as those transgressing from one jurisdiction to another. This situation is in contrast to the U.S. Model Law or Uniform Law or Model Act concept based on its federalism form of government. This law making concept would reduce inconsistencies and enhance uniformity in legislation concerning the same matter in different states. The drafted laws do not bind the states and are only used as legislation guidelines in all states (Cornell Law School, 2007; Harvard Law School, 2007).

The contents of local ordinances of each local administrative organization may be similar or different due to their own situation and problems. In this regard, the concept towards resolving the differences of the essential elements of local ordinances dealing with the same matter is similar to the concept in the making of the “Model Law”, or the “Uniform Law” or the “Model Act” of the United States. Two types of law analysis were conducted in order to attain the structure and format as well as the analytical technique for the preparation of local ordinances for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution in the context of Thai laws. The first was an analysis of laws and regulations relevant to the formulation of structure and format of the law. The second was a comparative analysis of structure and format of national level legislation (Acts) and local level legislation (Ordinances) of the same subject currently in force.

The analyses showed that the structure and format of the local ordinances mainly resemble those of the Acts with slight differences. In this regard, a suitable structure and format for the local legislative model for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution should essentially contain 11 parts, as follows: (1) the principle and rationale of the legislation, (2) the title of the legislation, (3) preambles, (4) definitions, (5) person in charge, (6) cancellation, amendments and additions, (7) changes of wording in the law, (8) chapter organization and structure, (9) enforcement, (10) interim provisions, and (11) attached schedules.

To avoid inconsistencies with higher strata laws, the contents regarding reduction and elimination of environmental pollution to be incorporated in the structure and format of the local ordinance model should be analyzed by the drafter(s) using a 3-stage analytical technique. Stage 1 is an analysis of the scope of powers and duties regarding reduction and elimination of environmental pollution as provided by law. Stage 2 is an analysis of the measures for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution to be introduced by the local administrative organization as provisions in its local ordinance for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution. Finally, Stage 3 is an analysis of the conditions and restrictions prescribed by law on authorizing local administrative organizations to determine enforceability.
The structure and format of the local ordinance model for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution and the 3-stage analytical technique that were developed by this study are viable as a tool for the drafting of local ordinances in Thailand. This was confirmed by the second key stakeholder seminar, where the discussion indicated that participants felt that the findings of this study and the local ordinance model will help local administrative organizations to take action regarding environmental pollution and for other matters related to the situation and issues of each local administrative organization. It was also suggested that a manual for drafting local ordinances be published for distribution to local administrative organizations.

**Discussion and Conclusion**

This study shows that the problems and obstacles preventing local administrative organizations from efficiently reducing and eradicating their environmental pollution have been caused by several reasons. The failure to introduce local ordinances to address these issues is due to localities' lack of clear understanding of the scope of their duties and powers in the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution as provided in various laws. In addition, as local ordinances are subordinate legislation enforceable only in its own jurisdiction that should not be inconsistent with the laws of higher strata, further analysis of existing legislation is needed for localities to take action. As there are no laws or regulations prescribing the structure and format of local ordinances, local administrative organizations find it difficult to develop the needed ordinances. Finally, drafting of local ordinances for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution requires relevant knowledge in various fields. For these reasons, local administrative organizations in Thailand find it extremely difficult to draw up a local ordinance for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution in their locality.

Through document review the study also finds that there are a cluster of laws prescribing the scope of powers and duties in the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution in specified jurisdictions. These consist of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand, B.E. 2550 (A.D. 2007), the ten Acts concerning the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution, the five Acts establishing local administrative organizations, and the Act Prescribing Plan and Procedure for the Decentralization of Power to Local Administrative Organizations, B.E. 2542 (A.D. 1999). This cluster of laws was used to develop the 3-stage technique and methods for drafting the contents of local ordinances suggested by this study.

The output of this study is a model for the structure and format of local ordinances for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution and the techniques for the preparation of contents for these ordinances by the local administrative organizations. Public dissemination and utilization of this model would help to prevent local ordinances from being inconsistent
with the laws of higher strata. It would also enhance the uniformity of local ordinances in other regions of the country which are being enforced in parallel with national level legislation by the central and regional administrations. It would also help to promote the rights of the people and communities in each locality to propose local ordinances under the Act for Petition Lodging to Propose Local Ordinance, B.E. 2542 (A.D. 1999), which would reasonably solidify the communities against the pollution problems within the locality.

Furthermore, in order to establish the local ordinance model for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution and to escalate the efficiency of the local administrative organizations in enforcing these laws, this study proposes that the Acts concerning these issues be amended to be in harmony with the powers and duties of local administrative organizations as provided by Section 290 of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand, B.E. 2550 (A.D. 2007). This is to allow local administrative organizations to jointly play greater roles of law enforcement with the central and regional administrations for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution. It is also proposed that an organization to support law enforcement for addressing environmental issues be established. Such an organization could gather knowledge and information relevant to these measures from various law enforcing agencies under the central administration engaging in the tasks of enhancement and conservation of national environmental quality. As a result, databases necessary for the prescription of measures for the reduction and elimination of environmental pollution could be established for the purpose of proclamation of local ordinances.

Notes


**References**


Act for the Administration of Bangkok Metropolis, B.E. 2528 (A.D. 1985).


Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand, B. E. 2540 (A.D. 1997).

Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand, B. E. 2550 (A.D. 2007).


