

## **The Context Study of Collaboration in Prototype City of Agricultural Processing Industry Project, Nongjik District, Pattani Province**

**Yutthakij Jiansuwannapas<sup>1</sup> / Ploy Suebvises<sup>2</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Graduated School of Public Administration, National Institute of Development Administration

**Received:** April 19, 2023

**Revised:** April 27, 2023

**Accepted:** April 27, 2023

**DOI:** <http://doi.org/10.14456/jhusoc.2023.10>

### **Abstract**

This article aims to study the Processed Agricultural Products Industry Model City of Nongjik District, Pattani province, based on the Collaborative Governance theory with the following objectives: 1) to study the conditions that lead to collaboration and the Collaborative Governance theory, 2) to analyze the collaboration based on the Collaborative Governance theory. and 3) to compile suggestions and directions in improving the management of urban development in the future. This research is qualitative research consisting of 17 main important informants from the government, business, and public sectors, divided into three levels: the policy level, the policy control level, and the implementation level. The research consists of a documentary study, in-depth interviews, and a field study using questionnaires and semi-structured interview methods. The analysis was done through content analysis. The result showed that the southern provinces have been facing poverty, a lack of knowledge in careers, and unrest caused by the conflict of ethnicity, religion, and the delay in the judicial process that led to the lack of trust in the government. The government has the policy of creating a pilot model city by

choosing Nongjik district as one of the three districts with the goal of developing into a processed agriculture model city due to the potential of the area.

**Keywords:** collaborative governance, prototype city of agricultural processing industry project, Nongjik District, Pattani Province

## Introduction

The governance of the cities in the southern provinces has the main goal of creating peace and stability in the area. Apart from adopting the method of maintaining peace, economic development to help increase the quality of life for the people in the area is another method that needs to be done in parallel. From the regional poverty situation, the southern provinces have the highest poverty rate compared to other regions. In 2016, it was found that the number of people facing poverty was 32.8 percent out of the whole population. In other words, one-third of the population was poor. The next region in terms of poverty was the northeast region at 13 percent, and the central region had the lowest poverty rate at 3.7 percent. Additionally, the poverty rate at the provincial level can reflect the economic problem more clearly, especially in the provinces where the poverty rate is higher than 20 percent of the whole population. The provinces with chronic and severe poverty dimensions were Mae Hong Son, Narathiwat, Pattani, Kalasin, Nakhon Phanom, Tak, and Buriram provinces. The government and its allies should prioritize the development and resolve the issue of poverty in this area (Office of the National Economic and Social Development Council, 2018).

On October 4<sup>th</sup>, 2016, the cabinet approved the principle of the “Triangle of Security, Wealth, and Longevity” Model City project (2017-2020). The direction for

the implementation according to the proposal of the National Economic and Social Development Council (NESDC) under the conceptual framework of this model city was the economic development in three districts, Nongjik District, Pattani Province, Su-ngai Kolok District, Narathiwat Province, and Betong District, Yala Province to be specific development areas. The investment from the private sector can help create jobs and generate income for the nearby area and other safe areas. Another objective was to develop the southern provinces to be a special economic zone, especially in areas with stability and safety. The economic investment can be expanded to the nearby areas and cause the southern provinces to have more safe areas to resolve the unrest problem and support the economic and social development in the future. The Model City project has the goal of developing Nongjik as the “Processed Agriculture Industry Model City,” Su-ngai Kolok District, Narathiwat Province, to be the “Center for Trans-National Border Trade” and Betong District, Yala Province, to be the “Sustainable Self-Reliance Model City” (Nongjik District, Pattani Province, n.d)).

Nongjik district is an important border city of Pattani province and the center for the route that connects Pattani, Yala, and Narathiwat provinces. According to the project, the city will be developed as an Agriculture Industry City. The projects focus on developing the area for the livelihood, happiness, and self-reliance of the people by not destroying nature, considering the geography, faith in religion, ethnicity, and the economic and social background, as well as the conflict in the area (National News Bureau of Thailand, 2019). Nongjik district covers an area of 231.5 square kilometers, with a population of 75,000 people from 11,800 households. Eighty-nine percent of the population area Islamic. The administration is divided into 12 sub-districts, 76 villages, 11 sub-district administration organizations, and two municipalities. As for the physical geography, most of the area consists of flat land

suitable for agriculture. Therefore, most of its economy comes from agricultural products, especially rice farming, coconuts, Para Rubber, and oil palm. The province has abundant resources from the ocean, which can fully support occupations in marine fisheries and coastal aquaculture. However, since the northern area of the province is connected to the Thai Gulf, where seawater floods into the land, some part of the soil lacks fertility and creates a problem of saline and acid soil that affects agricultural production. The reason Nongjik district was chosen as a pilot area in processed agriculture was due to the following basic factors: 1) the site for an industrial zone with agricultural industry factories and extended industries, such as a palm oil extraction plant with the production capacity of 60 tons/hour that can receive oil palms from over 120,000 rais, a two megawatts biogas power plant that sells the electricity to the Electricity Generating Authority, processed seafood industry, as well as fertilizer factories that uses the byproducts from the palm oil extraction. 2) agricultural areas that can support the expansion of the cultivation area for the raw materials for the agricultural industry that will be investing in the area, such as oil palms and other economic crops 3) the readiness in terms of the basic infrastructures, which is the main road that connects the transportation and logistic routes from Had Yai district, Songkhla province, to Malaysia, passing through Yala and Narathiwat provinces, and the Pattani port, that can be developed into a commercial port for transporting raw materials and agricultural products for export, and 4) the private sector is interested in investing in the agricultural industry and extended industry that goes in line with the potential, with the project plan within the budget of 12,000 – 15,000 million baht, such as oil palm extraction plant to increase the production, separation factory, stearin factory, palm oil packaging factory, B100 biodiesel factory, 49 megawatts biomass powerplants, 300 megawatts solar powerplants,

processed factories for fruits, seafood, and coconuts (Nongjik District, Pattani Province, n.d).

In the past, the development projects that came into the southern provinces were mainly implemented by the government while people were receivers. The project's outcome did not reach the objective of improving Pattani's economy from being one of the five poorest provinces of the country. Currently, there is participation from all sectors, whether it is the government sector, business sector, and the communities, in determining the problems, goals, and the development method is accepted as a necessity, especially the import of the ideas related to the participation of the public, especially the actual stakeholders. This method has gained support because it can lead to the expected outcome. Therefore, the research adopted the Collaborative Governance theory as a base in the research, which is a theory that directly supports the collaboration between the government and all the various parties. The southern provinces are facing economic and stability problems that have been accumulated with the complexity in many dimensions, in which the government has not been able to find the best practice until this concept of creating the model cities in the three provinces. Therefore, the researcher saw the importance of the study on Collaborative Governance: A Case Study of the Processed Agricultural Products Industry Model City of Nongjik District, Pattani province, which is different from the model city of Yala and Narathiwat provinces, where the emphasis is on the economic development in the border between Thailand and Malaysia, which might yield economic results, while agriculture is still the main occupation of the people in the area on most of the southern provinces. If the study on the context, the process, and the proposals for improving and developing the Processed Agricultural Products

Industry Model City of Nongjik District, Pattani province, was successful, it will be beneficial to a broader area and can also be applied in other areas.

The scope of this research does not cover the study of the products and the outcome of the project since this is the government's pilot project that designed the framework moving forward with different plans for activities and the designated timeframe and goals. After the timeframe and the support ends, the distribution of the resources, especially the budget that will help achieve the goals, will return to the normal bureaucratic process. Therefore, the consideration of the project's outcome in terms of improving the household economy and the better quality of life of the farmers cannot be considered.

### **Research Objectives**

1. To study the starting conditions of the Processed Agricultural Products Industry Model City of Nongjik District, Pattani province
2. To Study the collaborative project management among the government, business, and community enterprise sectors of the Processed Agricultural Products Industry Model City of Nongjik District, Pattani province
3. To compile the proposal for the management improvement of the Processed Agricultural Products Industry Model City of Nongjik District, Pattani province

### **Literature Review**

Ansell and Gash (2008) define the term “Collaborative Governance” as an administration under more than one government agency working with other stakeholders outside the government to officially make decisions by focusing on

reaching a consensus through consideration to create public policy or the management of a project of public properties.” They also proposed several following factors that contribute to the collaboration of all stakeholders: 1) Starting conditions, which include (1) inequality in terms of power, resources, and knowledge, 2) the history of collaboration and conflict towards one another to know the level of collaboration of the stakeholders, and 3) the motivation and limitation to the collaboration. The first two factors will allow the working team to design the motivation to involve the stakeholders. At the same time, the two factors will also provide an understanding of the limitation of the collaboration. These three starting conditions influence the quality of the administration that will follow: 1) facilitative leadership, as well as the empowerment of the working process, 2) institutional design in the form of collaboration needed to have participatory inclusiveness of all parties, with exclusive forums, clear ground rules, and a transparent process, and 3) collaborative process starting from (1) face-to-face dialogue through good faith negotiation, (2) trust building, (3) commitment to the process that is based on the following principles: Mutual recognition of interdependence, shared ownership of the process, and openness to exploring mutual gains, (4) shared understanding, with the principle of clear mission, common problem definition, and identification of common values, and (5) intermediate outcomes consisting of small wins, strategic plans, and joint fact-finding.

## **Methodology**

This research was qualitative research consisting of a documentary study and a field study with the following steps:

**Step 1:** Documentary study of the context, the history, the project detail, the plan, the steps, and the implementation process based on government official documents, research, database, and electronic media related to the development of the southern provinces and the project

**Step 2:** Field study by going into the field to interview the key informants and observe the example of the outcome from the project implementation/data collection activities

**Step 3:** Key informants were chosen through nonprobability sampling with the purposive sampling method, consisting of the following 17 informants from three sectors who have different levels of responsibility in the implementation of the work:

3.1) Ten government representatives who currently is or was officials within Nongjik district, Pattani province, with more than five years of experience. The representatives were divided into three following levels: (1) four officials from the central office, executives and former executives from the Office of the Prime Minister, Ministry of Interior, Southern Border Provinces Administrative Center (SBPAC), with one representative at the policy level and three representatives overseeing the policy. (2) three government officials from the regional level, executives and former executives, with two representatives overseeing the policy and one working in the field. (3) Three current and former administrators at the sub-district administrative organizations in Nongjik district, Pattani province.

3.2) Four representatives from the business sector, two representatives overseeing the policy, and two representatives in the field

3.3) Three representatives from the civil society sector from local farmers and members of the community enterprise



**Step 4:** The tools used for this research was a semi-structured interview with open-ended questions allowing the informants to freely provide the information to meet the goals.

**Step 5:** Data collection using in-depth interviews using narrative methodology

**Step 6:** Data analysis through content analysis from documentary study and in-depth interview. The results were also presented using descriptive analysis.

**Step 7:** Conclusion of the study and present the result through the descriptive method.

## Results

Based on the first objective 1, the research results showed that:

1. The Power/Resource/Knowledge Asymmetries: The majority of the farmers in the southern provinces are poor, not having enough income to sustain their lives, which led to a quality of life that is less than the standard. In addition, they lack the higher knowledge and resources for occupations, which prevents them from efficiently generating income. Therefore, farmers failed to improve the livelihood of their families. The people felt the injustice in their rights and freedom and the discrimination. This problem resulted in unrest in the area that is still ongoing. As the owner of the resources and possessing the power in using the laws, the government needs to lend a hand in creating development projects to eradicate these problems.

2. Prehistory of Antagonism and Cooperation: The unrest in the southern provinces had always been a problem concerning the stability of the Thai government for a long time since the inclusion of Cape Malay in the southern border provinces to Perak and Terengganu (currently belong to Malaysia) as part of the Kingdom of

Thailand in 1985, as well as the centralization of power in Bangkok, which had always been opposed through different levels of violence. This also includes the use of government forces that led to the lost of lives and possessions, such as the violence in front of the Kerisek mosque on April 28<sup>th</sup>, 2004, and the crackdown of the protest in Tak Bai on October 25<sup>th</sup>, 2004, which led to the lack of trust amongst the people in collaborating in development projects. Additionally, from the people's perspective, the project's implementation by the government also lacks continuity, an uncertain amount of budget for the projects, changes to each project, and the target groups are only limited to community enterprises.

3. Incentives and constraints on the participation: It was found that the government came up with the projects according to the projects' objectives of developing the southern provinces into specific economic zones by doing pilot projects in the areas that have the readiness in terms of stability and boost the economy to lead to the economic expansion in the nearby areas to help improve the people's quality of life by creating stable income and creating more safe areas as a way to support the resolution to the unrest and prepare for the economic and social development in the future. In designating Nongjik as a processed agriculture industry model city, the project was steered under the following framework consisting of six aspects to help influence the business sector and the community enterprise to participate in the project: 1) Supporting agricultural career, 2) Expansion of the cultivation area to unused lands, 3) Expansion of the livestock-raising area, 4) Supporting agricultural processed products industry, 5) Development of the basic transportation infrastructures, and 6) Amendment of the laws to facilitate investment.

The example of the project steering framework in the tables shows that each plan/activity primarily consists of the collaboration between the government,

private, and public sectors, which means the farmers develop their cultivation, products, livestock, fishery, production capacity, and quality, and process product

**Table 1**

*Steering Framework for the Triangle of Security, Wealth, and Longevity” Model City project in Nongjik District*

No.	Project Steering Framework
1.	The support for the occupations related to agriculture in expanding their farmland to provide the raw materials to the industries that have plans to invest in the area and the support for the existing occupations related to agriculture; for instance, the support for rice farmers, coconut farmers, palm farmers, and farmers growing other crops, to lower their input cost by using agricultural technology and innovative system for managing their agricultural data by using GIS and ONE MAP (measure soil, land, and air quality) in the area.
2.	The expansion of the farming area to unused land to support the entrepreneur on the area of 24,000 rais of land, or 16 percent of the total area. There is a need for 350,000 tons, or about 90,000 rais, of oil palms (Palm Pattana Southern Border Co. Ltd.) that is expected to provide jobs opportunity to over 6,000 farmers.
3.	The expansion of household farmland to support livestock raising, as well as supporting large-scale livestock farms, especially for the production of meat consumption in the area; which covers beef, chicken, goat, and sheep, to substitute the imports of meat from outside of the area, or from other countries, as well as supporting processed products.

**Table 1 (Continued)**

No.	Project Steering Framework
4.	The drive for the local fishery was done by integrating the related offices in providing the framework for the solution and managing the public hearing of the stakeholders around Pattani bay. The emphasis was put on the management of natural and environmental resources, generating income for the people within the community, supporting the production of fresh seafood and non-chemical processed seafood, using environmentally friendly fishing tools, as well as the development of the appropriate innovation and technology that aligns with the way of life of the people
5.	The investment support for the extended industry and the processed agriculture products that the investors were interested in comprised the palm and bio-diesel industry, biomass powerplant industry, full-cycle processed coconut industry, and processed fruit industry.
6.	The development of the basic infrastructure to support the connection of the transportation routes, the improvement of transportation routes number 42 and 43, the improvement of the Pattani port and Kok Pho Sri train station to increase the capacity of goods transportation.
7.	Adjusting the regulations and the laws to facilitate investment

Source: Nongjik District, Pattani Province (n.d.)

**Table 2**

*Project Plan According to the Policy and Support for the Triangle of Security, Wealth, and Longevity” Model City project*

<b>No.</b>	<b>Project Plan</b>
1.	<p><b>“Triangle of Security, Wealth, and Longevity” Model City project plan</b></p> <p>A total of 12 projects with a budget of 1,754,322.500 baht</p> <p>The construction of a livestock market at the southern border to support the Halal industry, highway number 43 (3 projects), restoration of the unused land for oil palm plantation of Nongjik district, improvement of the fishing port, improvement of the wave barriers at the port and the area around Pattani port, construction of trade hub other than fishing boats, Kam Ling water storage pond in Nongjik district, Trade One-Stop Service (OSS), and the improvement of the water pipe system to increase the capacity of the rice paddy fields in Nongjik district.</p>
2.	<p><b>Projects following the direction of building strength and sustainability for the domestic economy within Pattani province</b></p> <p>A total of 11 projects with a budget of 543,095,100 baht</p> <p>The development of Pattani fishing port, solving the traffic problem in Pattani city, survey and design an over junction bridge (Don Yang), fertility building of coastal and major watershed resources to increase productivity for basic economy projects, water management efficiency building project in the Saiburi and Pattani watershed areas, construction of a central livestock market, phase 2, to increase the capacity of meat production, improve the potential for historical and cultural tourism of Pattani province,</p>

**Table 2 (Continued)**

No.	Project Plan
	support and develop plant production to build economy community, establish smoked rubber factory to increase the value of rubber in Pattani province, increase the capacity of rice production with machinery
3.	<p data-bbox="196 438 980 534"><b>Project following the direction in building strength and sustainability for the domestic economy in Pattani province (special mega project)</b></p> <p data-bbox="196 534 980 582">A total of one project with a budget of 680,000,000 baht</p> <p data-bbox="196 582 980 694">Construction of a ring road around Pattani province and a bridge over Pattani river</p>
4.	<p data-bbox="196 702 980 853"><b>Plan for economic development and household income increase in the southern provinces under the “Triangle of Security, Wealth, and Longevity” Model City project, Pattani province</b></p> <p data-bbox="196 853 980 901">A total of five projects and 15 activities with a budget of 158,707,100 baht</p> <p data-bbox="196 901 980 997">1. Project supporting the cultivation of plants that require less water (five activities)</p> <p data-bbox="196 997 980 1109">Support the planting of Planting 1) Peanuts 2) Mung Beans 3) Sweet Corn 4) Watermelon 5) Sweet Potatoes</p> <p data-bbox="196 1109 980 1204">2. Project for improving highway number 42 and the construction of raised median strip (one activity)</p> <p data-bbox="196 1204 980 1300">3. Project to create food stability in the “Triangle of Security, Wealth, and Longevity” project (three activities):</p> <p data-bbox="196 1300 980 1396">1) Construction of hen house and pen with equipment 2) Improvement to the Muscovy duck houses 3) production support</p>

**Table 2 (Continued)**

No.	Project Plan
	4. Project to support and expand oil palm plantations (three activities): 1) cost for improvement and preparation of area 2) cost for the palm variety 3) cost of fertilizers and first year management
	5. Project to support and develop the career of processing agricultural products (three activities) 1) plants 2) livestock 3) fishery

Source Nongjik District, Pattani Province (n.d.)

Based on the second objective, the research results were presented as the following:

### 1. Institutional Design

After the cabinet approved the “Triangle of Security, Wealth, and Longevity” Model City principle according to the proposal by the NESDC and the sub-district administrative organization council, the Nongjik District Chief appointed the following committee for the implementation of the work: 1) The governor appointed the Nongjik District Health Board, which is an integration of the agencies related to the Ministry of Interior and Ministry of Public Health. Nongjik District Chief was the chairperson. 2) The Nongjik District Chief appointed the “Triangle of Security, Wealth, and Longevity” Model City integrated steering committee at the district level with the responsibility of determining the direction and laying out the implementation plan, work/activities/project plan, with the Nongjik District Chief as the chairperson. 3) Nongjik District Chief appointed the working committee to support the steering of the “Triangle of Security, Wealth, and Longevity” Model

City, divided into four clusters with the responsibility of efficiently supporting the “Triangle of Security, Wealth, and Longevity” Model City: (1) Economy mission includes the different factors related to income, career, and unemployment, with the District Permanent Secretary as the head of the working group. (2) Educational mission includes equally supporting people to have the knowledge, both within and outside of the educational system, and the educational institutions, both nonautonomous and autonomous. The deputy director of the Primary Educational Service Area Office is the head of the working group. (3) Public health mission includes overseeing the mental and physical health, the sicknesses of the people. The director of Nongjik hospital is the head of the working group. And (4) stability missions include different factors related to the stability and safety in the lives and possessions of the people. The Superintendent of the Provincial Police Station is the head of the working group.

In transitioning the policies to implementation, the Nongjik district chief held a meeting with every sector within the Nongjik District Health Board, divided into the following administration team, coordination team, and working team.

Team Big, a team of administrators and leaders

Team Bright, a sub-committee coordinators and monitoring team

Team Beef, a team of workers or taking the implementation to the household level

The next phase is to hold a meeting of the small teams to create an understanding, exchange and learn, and brainstorm on the different aspects of the problems. Afterward, the problems will be separated according to the mission groupings. The conclusion will then be taken into implementation.



## **2. Facilitative Leadership**

The model city project determined the role of the district chief and the district team under the following best practice principle: 1) The change leaders related to the work process, attitudes, as well as access to the areas/community, especially in the rural areas, in which the communities still need support in improving the quality of life and livelihood. 2) As the chairperson of the Nongjik District Health Board, the meeting participants need to analyze the problems related to the quality of life of the people in the area to create a plan to improve the overall quality of life in Nongjik district. The quality of life improvement plan will be sent to the different related agencies according to the clusters. 3) Moving the work forward and monitoring the work to be implemented according to the objectives was done through a memorandum of collaboration with the Nongjik District Health Board and coordinating in collaboration with all government, private, and public sectors in the form of a civil state model.

## **3. Collaborative Process**

Based on the third objective 3, the proposal for the development of the administration in the model city project was revealed as follows:

1. Current mega projects by the government need to collaborate with different sectors, especially in areas with special characteristics, for instance, areas with stability issues or sensitive areas along the borders. Roles should be given to all parties in helping determine the policy in order to reduce the obstacles to genuinely implementing those policies. Normal bureaucracy and mechanisms are not suitable for special projects in a special area. The government should have a mechanism to gain collaboration from the policy level by changing the complicated language in the strategies to be applied in the implementation with the business sector, community

enterprises, and villagers to create a supportive plan throughout the project.

Currently, Community enterprises and villagers do not have any plan following the government policy. They only prepared activities that were involved with the project and carried on their regular livelihood.

2. The government sector should support and use the strength of the business sector investing in the area to benefit the agricultural sector in processing agricultural products. Since the private sector has the capacity to increase agricultural products values, the government should use the strength of the industrial sector to connect the agricultural sector with the business sector as an investor in the area, importing the technology to help with the process of agricultural products with a higher speed and quality, and higher production scale. Additionally, the strength of the industrial sector can help gain acceptance of the local products through a standard, which is a form of relying on the strength of the business sector to improve the agricultural product in the area

3. The regional and local government agencies are the closes agencies to the people. Therefore, these two agencies have a crucial role in creating trust that will lead to collaboration in the development project in the area to achieve the designated goals. Emphasis should be put on communicating about the project to the people to help them understand the context of the project and not only implementing the activities according to the government's support.

4. The collaboration between each sector will reduce the inequality in the area. Collaborated work can help the resources to work more efficiently than working in separation. In practice, if the government connects the local mechanism to the collaborative work at the community enterprise level, as well as connecting to the industrial sector to create a demand chain, this will help create an interrelated

mechanism that will benefit the upstream, midstream, and the downstream process can help this model city to attain a high capacity in the international market competition.

5. The outcome should provide a result in the foreseeable future. Solving the issues of poverty is an issue with many related factors, and the success might not be possible within the timeframe of the project, such as the fact that this project only has a timeframe of four years; it is, therefore, difficult to solve the problem that has been accumulating for a long time. This study showed clear data for the development timeframe in the special areas with conflicts.

6. In collaborative governance, if a connection can be created between the community enterprise and the industrial group to create collaboration, the determination of the production scope from upstream to mid-stream with the transferring of knowledge from the industrial sector, as well as the budget to help feed the processed agricultural products to the industrial process, the production will have more capacity and efficiency.

7. In implementing the strategies by the government in the area, the strategies need to be in line with the community enterprises since the enterprises carried out the activities based on their skills and feelings during the period.

8. Apart from contributing to collaborative governance in the model city project, a network to help create peace in other southern provinces can be built.

9. Project transparency is most needed since it will affect the trust of the people and the business of the government. If the people's trust can be gained, apart from the success in improving the quality of life, it will also psychologically impact the stability of the government.

## Discussion

1. Research results for objective 1 showed that the public and private sectors collaborated with the government in this model city project because the government had presented the project/activity plans that addressed the need of every party at the same time, especially a project that requires collaboration, relying on one another, and potentials from many individuals in order to achieve the designated goals. For instance, having the farmers expand their oil palm plantation while making sure that the palm oil factory entrepreneurs need to increase the production capacity. This is in line with Emerson and Nabatchi (2015), who stated that motivation occurred from internal factors, such as the need for resources and benefits, or external factors, such as threats of opportunity to resolve issues. Therefore, collaboration with the related people needs to happen for all parties to think together about how to gain access, fulfill, and improve those factors and benefit from the results.

2. Research results from objective 2 showed that the steering committee for the “Triangle of Security, Wealth, and Longevity” Model City at the district level consist of the government, private, and public sector, appointed by the Committee for Solving Problems in the Southern Border. The organization’s structure consists of government, private, entrepreneurs, and many community enterprises working together. The organization is externally directed, which was in line with the findings by Donahue and Zeckhauser (2011), who concluded that if the collaboration is directed from the outside, there is normally an establishment of structures or platforms of the organizations, such as establishing implementation direction for the individuals and agencies that will be collaborating. The leaders need to persuade and motivate other agencies to participate. At the same time, this form might lack flexibility since all the implementations need to follow the initial agencies’ plan. The

reason the Nongjik District Chief is the chairperson of the project steering committee, coordinating with the government and all parties, and monitoring until the project is complete is because the work requires coordination with various parties and needs to have a leader from the government who has the power to give the order, being accepted, and can coordinate with every sector to willing follow. This is in line with Ansell and Gash (2008), who stated that leaders are essential in the establishment and creation of the regulations for collaboration, building trust, facilitating the consultation, and seeking the benefit for all parties through support, distributing power, and creating participation with the related parties and move the collaboration forward to the goal. The administration process consists of official meetings to present the problems, propose the solutions, and determine the collaboration's details since the goal is for all the related parties to have equal participation in the discussions in a polite manner and have an exchange according to the democratic process, creating trust between one another and trust in the collaboration process. This is in line with Gastil (2006), who proposed that consultations are a typical characteristic of the initial democratic process. In contrast, the highest level is analyzing the problems and finding solutions together, which requires every party to have equal rights in the discussions and exchanges based on diversity.

3. For the research results from objective 3, in the overview of the project administration, an opportunity was given to every party to participate in various ways. The relationship between the stakeholders in the collaboration was implemented according to the plan agreed upon within the steering framework of the project. No official commitment was made since the motivation for the farmers and the entrepreneurs to join the project was based on willingness. Therefore, the relationship between the workers is in the form of networks that are connected

through the projects/activities within the working timeframe and could not develop the collaboration to be an institute with long-term collaboration. In the study by Yang (2017), it was found that for the collaboration to be successful and become an institution, it needs to consist of three parties, which are the strong government, the private, and the public sector, having the same short and long term goals, the potential in the implementation, and sufficient resources. However. This project is only a pilot project with a short timeframe of four years. The supporting resources from the government for each aspect are limited. The government's goal in improving the household economy, all the way to creating peace within the area, cannot, therefore, be concluded. However, it can be said that it was a good beginning that received acceptance and satisfaction from the stakeholders. The related government agencies need to monitor the post-project result and maintain the relationship between the private and public sectors to mutually receive the benefits. This relationship can lead to the creation of the commitment from the willingness, such as signing an MOU or an exchange contract between the processing factories and the agriculture community enterprises.

### **Recommendations**

1. For the research implication, the government agencies, starting from the central, the regional, and the local level, need to fully understand the starting condition of the collaboration. The establishment of the collaboration organization needs to be opened to all stakeholders and an administrative form that creates trust between one another.

2. For further studies, there should be a comparative study on the other two model city projects, which is the sustainable self-reliance city of Betong district, Yala

province and the model city for transnational border trade of Su-ngai Kolok District, Narathiwat Province.

## References

- Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(4), 543–571.
- Emerson, K., Nabatchi, T. (2015). *Collaborative governance regimes*. Washington, Dc: Georgetown University Press.
- Donahue, J. D., & Zeckhauser, R. J. (2011). *Collaborative governance: Private roles for public goals in turbulent*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.
- Gastil, J. (2006). Communication as deliberation. In G. J. Shepherd, J. S. John, & T. Striphas (Eds.), *Communication as...: Perspectives on Theory*. (164-173). SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Nongjik District, Pattani Province. (n.d). Best practice. Moving the “triangle of security, wealth, and longevity”, Integrated Advance Agricultural Industry City. Public Relations Documents.
- National News Bureau of Thailand. (2019). *Nongjik District, Pattani Province. Acceleration in the development of product processing potential following the guideline of the “triangle of security, wealth, and longevity” model city in supporting the industry and improving the quality of life*. 6083642394
- Office of the National Economic and Social Development Council. (2018). *Report on poverty and inequality of income at a regional level of Thailand. Bureau of Database Development and Social Indicators*.  
[https://www.nesdc.go.th/ewt\\_w3c/ewt\\_dl\\_link.php?nid=7787](https://www.nesdc.go.th/ewt_w3c/ewt_dl_link.php?nid=7787)

Yang, L. (2017). Types and institutional design principles of collaborative governance in a strong-government society: The case study of desertification control in northern China. *International Public Management Journal*, 20(4), 586-623.

**Author**

Mr. Yutthakij Jiansuwannapas

Public Administration (Human Resource Management)

Graduate School of Public Administration

Tel.: 087 494 9990

E-mail: yut74@hotmail.com